

Learning opportunities and responsive caregiving

Hamadani, Jena; Baker-Henningham, Helen; Tofail, Fahmida; Mehrin, Syeda; Grantham-McGregor, Sally

The Lancet Global Health

DOI:

[10.1016/S2214-109X\(19\)30191-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2214-109X(19)30191-3)

Published: 01/06/2019

Publisher's PDF, also known as Version of record

[Cyswllt i'r cyhoeddiad / Link to publication](#)

Dyfyniad o'r fersiwn a gyhoeddwyd / Citation for published version (APA):

Hamadani, J., Baker-Henningham, H., Tofail, F., Mehrin, S., & Grantham-McGregor, S. (2019). Learning opportunities and responsive caregiving. *The Lancet Global Health*, 7(6), e709. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S2214-109X\(19\)30191-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S2214-109X(19)30191-3)

Hawliau Cyffredinol / General rights

Copyright and moral rights for the publications made accessible in the public portal are retained by the authors and/or other copyright owners and it is a condition of accessing publications that users recognise and abide by the legal requirements associated with these rights.

- Users may download and print one copy of any publication from the public portal for the purpose of private study or research.
- You may not further distribute the material or use it for any profit-making activity or commercial gain
- You may freely distribute the URL identifying the publication in the public portal ?

Take down policy

If you believe that this document breaches copyright please contact us providing details, and we will remove access to the work immediately and investigate your claim.



Learning opportunities and responsive caregiving

The Comment by Frances Aboud and Aisha Yousafzai (March 1, p e294–95)¹ on our Article (March 1, p e366–75)² on an early childhood intervention in Bangladesh contains some misunderstandings, which might limit its use by others.

Aboud and Yousafzai¹ suggest that our curriculum does not include responsive caregiving. We believe that distinguishing between early learning opportunities and responsive caregiving is misleading, because they complement each other. Early learning opportunities should be provided by a responsive caregiver, which is a crucial component of this curriculum. The intervention does not consist of training children, rather it is designed to support mothers to interact and play with their child, using developmentally appropriate play materials. Aboud and Yousafzai suggest that children learn language from caregivers verbally responding to them.³ Hence, the large language benefits we found provide evidence that caregivers increased their responsivity with the intervention.²

Aboud and Yousafzai report that the intervention includes activities resembling the Bayley test.¹ Designing play programmes that do not include these types of activities (eg, blocks, puzzles, and books) is difficult and probably inappropriate. Our child development intervention² is the only intervention in low-income and middle-income countries that has shown comprehensive benefits (eg, intelligence quotient, mental health, and wages) up to the age of 22 years,^{3,4} showing its appropriateness. The sustainability of benefits is frequently used to justify expansion of early childhood development interventions.⁵ Our intervention has been adapted to include an age range of 18 months in a group session.

A best intervention probably does not exist and several different approaches are likely to be effective, which might vary by context and available resources. The present curriculum was adapted to the local context and run in 16 countries. It has also been scaled up in Peru and plans are afoot scale up in China and Bangladesh.

We declare no competing interests.

Copyright © 2019 The Author(s). Published by Elsevier Ltd. This is an Open Access article under the CC BY-NC-ND 4.0 license.

**Jena D Hamadani,
Helen Baker-Henningham,
Fahmida Tofail, Syeda F Mehrin,
Sally Grantham-McGregor
jena@icddr.org*

Maternal and Child Health Division, International Centre for Diarrhoeal Disease Research, Bangladesh, Dhaka 1000, Bangladesh (JDH, FT, SFM), School of Psychology, Bangor University, Bangor, UK (HB-H), University College London Great Ormond Street Institute of Child Health, London, UK (SG-M)

- 1 Aboud FE, Yousafzai AK. Scaling up child psychosocial stimulation programmes for young children. *Lancet Glob Health* 2019; 7: e294–95.
- 2 Hamadani JD, Mehrin SF, Tofail F, et al. Integrating an early childhood development programme into the Bangladeshi primary health care services: a cluster randomised trial. *Lancet Glob Health* 2019; 7: e366–75.
- 3 Gertler P, Heckman J, Pinto R, et al. Labor market returns to an early childhood stimulation intervention in Jamaica. *Science* 2014; 344: 998–1001.
- 4 Walker SP, Chang SM, Vera-Hernández M, Grantham-McGregor S. Early childhood stimulation benefits adult competence and reduces violent behavior. *Pediatrics* 2011; 127: 849–57.
- 5 WHO, UN Children's Fund, World Bank Group. Nurturing care for early childhood development: a framework for helping children survive and thrive to transform health and human potential. Geneva: World Health Organization, 2018.